PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES JUNE 23, 2014 Page 1 of 9

CITY OF ST. LOUIS CULTURAL RESOURCES OFFICE PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES JUNE 23, 2014

Board Members Present

Richard Callow, Chairman Alderman Craig Schmid Anthony Robinson David Richardson David Visintainer Nate Johnson Melanie Fathman

Legal Counsel

Barbara Birkicht

<u>Cultural Resources Office Staff Present</u>

Betsy H. Bradley, Director
Jan Cameron, Preservation Administrator
Andrea Gagen, Preservation Planner
Bob Bettis, Preservation Planner
Adona Buford, Administrative Assistant

Chairman Richard Callow called the roll. Seven (7) members were present. Alderman Craig Schmid moved to approve the current Agenda and the May 26, 2014 minutes. Mr. Johnson seconded the motion. The motion passed.

SPECIAL AGENDA ITEMS – LANDMARK DESIGNATIONS

A. Tillie's Corner – 1345-55 N. Garrison Avenue

Petitioners: Miguel & Carla Alexander

PROCEEDINGS: On June 23, 2014, the Preservation Board of the City of St.

Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code,

to consider a proposed City Landmark Designation.

Board members, Richard Callow (Chairman), Alderman Craig Schmid, Melanie Fathman, Nate Johnson, David Richardson, David Visintainer, and Anthony Robinson were PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES JUNE 23, 2014 Page 2 of 9

present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Chairman Richard Callow moved to convene as a public hearing to hear a presentation regarding a Petition to designate Tillie's Corner as a Landmark. Ms. Fathman seconded the motion. The hearing was opened.

Ms. Betsy Bradley, Director of the Cultural Resources
Office presented a PowerPoint presentation and the
Petition and recommended support of the proposed
landmark. Carla and Miguel Alexander made a
presentation about the proposed Landmark that included
Mr. KP Dennis presenting the "Tillie's Corner Rap."
Karen Bode Baxter testified on behalf of significance of the
proposed landmark site and Ms. Bradley read into the
record a letter from Michael Allen that supported the
proposed landmark designation.

BOARD ACTION:

Board Member Alderman Schmid moved to approve the Petition to designate Tillie's Corner as a Landmark. Mr. Visintainer seconded the motion, which passed with six Board Members voting in favor of the motion and none voting against it.

Alderman Schmid moved that a Board Bill be prepared to send to the Board of Aldermen designating the site as a Landmark. Mr. Visintainer seconded the motion. The motion passed with six Board Members voting in favor of the motion and none voting against it.

B. New Age Federal Savings & Loan Building – 1401 N. Kingshighway Boulevard

Petitioner: Elcardo A. Moore, Sr.

PROCEEDINGS:

On June 23, 2014, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider a proposed City Landmark Designation.

Board members, Richard Callow (Chairman), Alderman Craig Schmid, Melanie Fathman, Nate Johnson, David Richardson, David Visintainer, and Anthony Robinson were present for the testimony for this agenda item. PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES JUNE 23, 2014 Page 3 of 9

Chairman Richard Callow moved to convene as a public hearing to hear a presentation regarding a Petition to designate the New Age Federal Savings and Loan Building as a Landmark. Ms. Fathman seconded the motion. The hearing was opened.

Ms. Betsy Bradley, Director of the Cultural Resources Office presented a PowerPoint presentation and the petition and recommended support for the proposed Landmark. She explained that the owner of the property, Mr. Elcardo A. Moore, Sr., could not be present at the meeting and that he had requested that the landmark status be initiated. No one from the public testified at the public hearing.

BOARD ACTION:

Board member David Richardson moved to approve the Petition to designate the New Age Federal Savings and Loan Building as a Landmark. Mr. Johnson seconded the motion, which passed with six Board Members voting in favor of the motion and none voting against it.

Alderman Craig Schmid moved that a Board Bill be prepared to send to the Board of Aldermen directing that the site be designated as a Landmark. Mr. Johnson seconded the motion. The motion passed with six Board Members voting in favor of the motion and none voting against it.

C. 2014.0697 1100 DOLMAN AVENUE LAFAYETTE SQ. HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: Kyle & Lindsey Miller

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Preliminary review to construct a new single-family house.

PROCEEDINGS: On June 23, 2014, the Preservation Board of the City of St.

Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider a preliminary review application to construct a 2-1/2 story single-family house at 1100 Dolman Street, located in the Lafayette Square Local and National Register

District.

Board members Richard Callow (Chairman), David Visintainer, Alderman Craig Schmid, Melanie Fathman,

David Richardson, Anthony Robinson and Nate Johnson were present for the testimony for this agenda item. Jan Cameron of the Cultural Resources Office discussed the project, and the proposed Historic Model Example. She stated that the design of the new building would comply with the Lafayette Square Historic District Standards for New Construction.

Kyle Miller, owner and builder of the project, testified on his own behalf.

Keith Houghton, of the Lafayette Square Restoration Committee's Design and Development Committee, indicated its support of the project.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- the site at 1100 Dolman Street, is located in the Lafayette Square Local historic district;
- 1901 Hickory Street, submitted by the applicant as a Historic Model Example, is appropriate; and
- the proposed design follows the HME and therefore complies with the requirements of the New Construction Standards for the Lafayette Square Historic District.

BOARD ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant preliminary approval to the project, with the condition that the design is developed as proposed and that design details be reviewed and approved by the Cultural Resources Office to ensure compliance with the Lafayette Square Historic District standards. The motion was made by Board Member Melanie Fathman. Mr. Nate Johnson seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously with none opposing.

D. 2014.0700 1720 CARROLL STREET LAFAYETTE SQ. HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: John Muller

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Preliminary review to construct a single family dwelling

with a side porch.

PROCEEDINGS: On June 23, 2014, the Preservation Board of the City of St.

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES JUNE 23, 2014 Page 5 of 9

Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider a preliminary review application to construct a two-story single-family house with large side porch at 1720 Carroll Street, located in the Lafayette Square Local and National Register District.

Board members Richard Callow (Chairman), David Visintainer, Alderman Craig Schmid, Melanie Fathman, David Richardson, Anthony Robinson and Nate Johnson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Jan Cameron of the Cultural Resources Office discussed the project, and the proposed Historic Model Example. She stated that the proposed side porch did not follow a Historic Model Example, but that a privacy fence would be erected behind the building line that would screen the lower part of the porch. She submitted drawings from the developer showing a sightline study to confirm this. She recommended that the porch be made narrower to reflect the usual depth of historic porches.

Lori Light, homeowner, testified on her own behalf.

Keith Houghton, of the Lafayette Square Restoration Committee's Design and Development Committee, indicated their support of the project conditional upon installation of the privacy fence, but suggested consideration be given to reducing the depth of the porch.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- the site at 1720 Carroll Street, is located in the Lafayette Square Local historic district;
- the details of the proposed porch use a historic porch on Benton Place as an appropriate Historic Example although the depth does not, and
- the homeowner has agreed to construct a solid wall or fence to screen the porch.

BOARD ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant preliminary approval to the project, with the condition that a solid fence be erected to screen the porch and that the applicant work with the Cultural Resources Office on the fence design to ensure compliance with the Lafayette Square Historic District standards. The motion was made by Board Member Nate Johnson. Mr. Visintainer seconded

the motion. The motion carried unanimously with none opposing.

E. 2014.0376 3242 MISSOURI AVENUE BENTON PARK HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner: Gordhan & Saroj Patel Applicant/Appellant: John Skaggs

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Appeal of a denial of a building permit application to retain a

fence and front porch erected without a permit.

PROCEEDINGS: On June 23, 2014, the Preservation Board of the City of St. Louis

met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider an appeal of the Director's Denial of building permit applications to retain a chain link fence and porch roof at 3242 Missouri, in the Benton Park Local Historic District. The applicant

submitted the appeal.

Board members Richard Callow, Alderman Craig Schmid, David Visintainer, David Richardson, Melanie Fathman, Nate Johnson, and Anthony Robinson were present for the testimony for this agenda item.

Andrea Gagen of the Cultural Resources Office made a presentation that examined the sections of City Ordinance #67175 which set forth the standards for residential rehabilitation in the Benton Park Local Historic District. She testified that the projects were not in compliance with the Standards as chain link is not an allowed material on a Semi-Public Façade and further that the porch roof was not based on a Historic Model Example.

Ms. Gagen entered into the record certified copies of Ordinances #64689, as amended by #64932 and #67175, the Board agenda and the PowerPoint presentation for 3242 Missouri, and the building permit application, including all construction documents.

John Skaggs, the appellant, testified on his own behalf stating that he did install the additional chain link fencing and the porch roof, that he believed was appropriate. A letter from the Benton Park Neighborhood Association Building Review Committee in support of the Director's denial was submitted into the record. An email from a citizen concurring with the neighborhood's position was also submitted, as well as a handout provided by Mr. Skaggs.

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

JUNE 23, 2014 Page 7 of 9

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- 3242 Missouri is located in the Benton Park Local Historic District;
- a new section of 4-foot high chain link fencing was installed around the parking pad area at a Semi-Public façade without a permit;
- the new chain link fencing does not conform to the Benton Park Historic District Standards and is visible from the street;
- the front porch roof and post were constructed without a permit; and
- the front porch roof and post are not based on an Historic Model Example, and therefore the porch does not meet the Benton Park Historic District standards.

BOARD ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to uphold the Director's denial of the building permits because the fencing and the porch roof do not comply with the Benton Park Historic District standards. The motion was made by Board member Dave Visintainer and seconded by Mr. Richardson. The motion passed with six Board Members voting in favor of the motion and none opposing it.

F. 2014.0530 2835 SHENANDOAH AVENUE FOX PARK HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: Jeffrey & Kelly Timmerberg

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Appeal of a denial of a building permit application to retain

non-compliant painting of exterior masonry.

PROCEEDINGS: On June 23, 2014, the Preservation Board of the City of St.

Louis met, pursuant to Ordinance #64689 of the City Code, to consider an appeal of the Director's Denial of a building permit application to retain non-compliant painting of masonry at 2835 Shenandoah, in the Fox Park Certified

Local Historic District. The owner submitted the

application and the appeal.

Board members Richard Callow, Alderman Craig Schmid, David Visintainer, David Richardson, Melanie Fathman, Nate Johnson, and Anthony Robinson were present for the

testimony for this agenda item.

Bob Bettis of the Cultural Resources Office made a

presentation that examined the section of City Ordinance #66098 that sets forth the standards for residential rehabilitation in the Fox Park Local Historic District. He testified that the project was not in compliance with the Standards as limestone foundation and window sills were not repainted the same color as the stone or the previous paint color.

Mr. Bettis entered into the record certified copies of Ordinances #64689, as amended by #64932 and #66098; the Board agenda and the PowerPoint presentation for 2835 Shenandoah.

Kelly Timmerberg, the owner and appellant, testified on her own behalf, stating that the she and her husband painted the stone green because they preferred the color to what was there previously.

FINDINGS OF FACTS:

The Preservation Board found that:

- 2835 Shenandoah is located in the Fox Park Certified Local Historic District;
- the stone foundation and sills were painted without a permit from the Cultural Resources; and
- the new paint color applied does not replicate the original color of the limestone and did not maintain the existing color of the painted stone, an orange color that was not appropriate for the building.

BOARD ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to overturn the Director's denial of the building permit and allow the painted masonry to remain. The motion was made by Board Member David Richardson. Mr. Johnson seconded the motion. Board members Nate Johnson, David Visintainer, David Richardson and Melanie Fathman voted in favor of the motion. Alderman Schmid and Anthony Robinson opposed the motion. The motion passed four to two.

- G. 2225 CHIPPEWA Deferred
- H. 6016 WASHINGTON Deferred
- I. 2205 LYNCH STREET Deferred
- J. 816 WILMINGTON Deferred

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES JUNE 23, 2014 Page 9 of 9

Alderman Craig Schmid made a motion to adjourn the meeting, Mr. Visintainer seconded the motion. The meeting was adjourned.